

Public Hearing Questions for
Tennessee Council for Career and Technical Education
Created by Section 49-11-201, *Tennessee Code Annotated*
(Sunset termination June 2017)

1. Provide a brief introduction to the Council, including information about its purpose, statutory duties, staff, and administrative attachment.

The Tennessee Council for Career and Technical Education (Council), authorized by T.C.A. § 49-11-201, advocates for quality Career and Technical Education (CTE) programs which prepare students for success in postsecondary education, careers, and life. The duties of the Council are outlined in T.C.A. § 49-11-202 and include: analyzing and reporting on the distribution of spending for career and technical education in the state and on the availability of career and technical education activities and services within the state; advising the state board of education and making reports to the governor, the business community and general public on ways to strengthen career and technical education; consulting with the state board of education on the establishment of evaluation criteria for career and technical education programs within the state; and evaluating career and technical education program delivery systems across the state. The Council is administratively housed in the Department of Education and Chelsea Parker, The Department of Education's Executive Director, Work-Based Learning and the Tennessee Council for Career and Technical Education, serves as executive director and staffs the Council.

2. Provide a list of current Council members and describe how membership complies with Section 49-11-201(b), *Tennessee Code Annotated*. Who appoints members? Are there any vacant positions on the Council? If so, what steps have been taken to fill the vacancies?

Thirteen members are appointed by the Governor and serve terms of six years. (See attached Membership list.) Seven individuals are representative of the private sector in the state, of which five (5) represent business, industry, trade organizations and agriculture and two (2) represent labor organizations. Six individuals are representative of secondary and postsecondary career and technical institutions, career guidance and counseling, and one member serves as a representative of special education. In the event of a vacancy, a reappointment shall be made within fifteen days.

There is currently one vacant position, representing labor organizations that we are currently working to fill. In the past two years, all but one member's term have expired and new members have been appointed to fill these vacancies.

3. Does the Council's membership include public/citizen members? Female members? Members of a racial minority? Members who are 60 years of age or older at the time of appointment?

The Council membership includes public/citizen members that represent a variety of stakeholder groups from the east, middle, and west grand divisions. Four members are female, two members represent racial minorities, and at least one member was older than 60 years of age at the time of appointment.

4. What per diem or travel reimbursement do members receive? How much was paid to Council members during fiscal years 2015 and 2016?

Council members receive a \$50.00 stipend each day of attendance at meetings. They also receive reimbursement at state travel, food, and lodging rates.

Fiscal Year 2015: \$19,388.08

Fiscal Year 2016: \$31,606.72

5. How many times did the Council meet in fiscal years 2015 and 2016? How many members were present at each meeting?

The Council meets four times per year. Three regular meetings, fall, winter and spring; and one public forum that meets the requirements laid out in statute.

Fiscal year 2015

- Fall 2014: 8 members
- Public Forum 2014-2015: 5 members
- Winter 2015: 9 members
- Spring 2015: 9 members

Fiscal year 2016

- Fall 2015: 7 members
- Winter 2016: 11 members
- Public Forum 2015-2016: 11 members
- Spring 2016: 8 members

6. Is the Council subject to Sunshine Law requirements (Section 8-44-101 et seq., *Tennessee Code Annotated*) for public notice of meetings, prompt and full recording of minutes, and public access to minutes? If so, what procedures does the Council have for informing the public of its meetings and making its minutes available to the public?

Yes, the Council is subject to Sunshine Law requirements. All meetings are open to the public and meeting minutes and meeting dates are public posted online at <https://tn.gov/education/topic/Council>. Compiled information is also set into the context of statewide and national trends through the Biennial Report to inform the public of decisions and impact of CTE policies, practices, and funding. The Biennial Report is distributed in hard and soft copy, public posted online, and promoted through social media.

Stakeholders are proactively notified of upcoming meetings and public forums and invited to participate through CTE email listservs at the Department of Education and Tennessee Board of Regents. Increasingly, the Council has found social media as an effective method for reaching public stakeholders with key information and meeting notices. The Council tweets regularly to publicly notify stakeholders of meetings, public forums, state and national publications, and raise awareness for successful practices in Career and Technical Education.

7. What were the Council's revenues (by source) and expenditures (by object) for fiscal years 2015 and 2016?

The Council had no revenues or expenditures.

8. How does the Council ensure that its members and staff are operating in an impartial manner and that there are no conflicts of interest? If the Council operates under a formal conflict of interest policy, please attach a copy of that policy.

The Council does have a formal conflict of interest policy, but advises and draws public attention to opportunities for improvement at the discretion of regulating agencies. Going forward Council members will be required to sign the department's conflict of interest policy.

9. Can the Council promulgate rules? If so, please cite the reference.

No, the Council does not promulgate rules.

10. Please describe any reports prepared by the Council on its operations, activities, and accomplishments and specify to whom the reports are sent. If an annual report is prepared, please provide a copy of the most recent report.

The Council produces a biennial report on the state of CTE in Tennessee and makes commendations and recommendations to promote quality secondary and postsecondary CTE programs and improve access for all. The last report was published in 2014 and is available here: https://tn.gov/assets/entities/education/attachments/tccte_biennial_report_2014.pdf

A high-level summary of the Council's priorities based on the recommendations in the 2014 Biennial report is also attached. (See 2015-16 Council Priorities for General Assembly and TDOE.)

The 2016 Biennial Report is scheduled to be released in the fall and will be shared with the governor, all members of the general assembly, the state board of education, and leadership in the Department of Education and Tennessee Board of Regents as required by statute.

11. What were the major accomplishments of the Council during fiscal years 2015 and 2016? Specifically, describe the nature and extent of the Council's activities as they relate to each of the Council's duties and responsibilities set out in Section 49-11-202, *Tennessee Code Annotated*.

The Council undertook a number of activities during fiscal year aimed at increasing public outreach and engagement in CTE activities across the state. The Council redesigned the CTE Biennial Report to focus less on replicating information which is already available through existing sources and more on analysis of data and putting that information into context. Through this report, the council meets the majority of its priorities, including: (1) evaluating and promoting successful CTE programs, (2) providing information on the distribution of funding and available resources, (3) analyzing the alignment and modernization of secondary and postsecondary CTE programs to meet industry needs, and (4) advocating for the continued improvement of CTE education.

Members also participated in various CTE conferences to better prepare them to be successful in their roles. Participation in CTE conferences provided Council members with a great opportunity to become more familiar with CTE programs and economic trends, to support emerging initiatives that have the potential to improve the quality of CTE programs, to identify strong practices in secondary and postsecondary CTE, and ultimately, to make informed recommendations based on their findings. In the past two years, members of the Council have served as representatives at: the Institute for CTE Educators, the Governor's Conference on Economic and Community Development, the annual Pathways Tennessee Summit, the ACTE National Policy Seminar, ACTE's CareerTech VISION Conference, and the annual Tennessee Legislative Breakfast and Day on the Hill hosted by secondary CTE Directors. This is critical to the Council's ability to evaluate CTE programs in the state.

Additionally, in the 2015-2016 school year, the Council designed and administered a survey to learn more about the priorities and challenges in secondary CTE programs. Although survey participation was low in this first year, some interesting findings led to the design of roundtable conversations to enable Council members to dig into challenges and potential solutions alongside program directors at its 2015-2016 Public Forum. This model was so successful, attendance increased from around 15-20 attendees to approximately 95 attendees. The Council plans to expand this practice to allow for greater public voice and enable greater participation. In the past, public forums have involved a few stakeholders who must incur costs and take significant time away from their work as they travel to provide a formal presentation. It has been increasingly difficult to find presenters as this format was simply less effective than other strategies. Going forward, the Council plans to better engage stakeholders in constructive conversations that benefit participants as well as Council members. The Council feels this format will better appeal to employers, secondary and postsecondary CTE educators, and students and improve participation. This format also enables members to hear more directly from stakeholders and identify regional trends and needs.

12. Describe any items related to the Council that require legislative attention and your proposed legislative changes.

The requirement for one public forum annually, could be replaced by a fourth meeting and the addition of language to allow the Council to seek broader public input to reflect the needs of stakeholders by region. While the current format's intent is to seek public comment for the betterment of programs across the state, this can be better facilitated to include a broader base of feedback from more stakeholders. Other tools and resources are available that can help cumulatively build a stronger reflection of regionally-specific CTE needs and promising practices that should be shared across the state. Whereas recent public forums have resulted in few presentations that represent a small snapshot of practices and regional needs, the use of dynamic input tools such as surveys, social media, campus visits, and roundtable discussions would lead the Council to gain a deeper understanding of trends in CTE and make recommendations based on these cumulative findings.

Membership of the council could be amended to include representatives from Tennessee's growing industry sectors as defined by the Department of Economic and Community Development to assist in proactively addressing the state's largest skills gaps. Members from

these industries have a stake in promoting a healthy secondary and postsecondary CTE system to support their growth. For example, Tennessee has a need for Information Technology, Healthcare, and Advanced Manufacturing and it would be to the benefit of the Council to ensure a forward facing and progressive Council to assist in aligning CTE programs to address the state's biggest growth needs.

Appointments could be amended to require appointments be made within 60 days. The current language requiring appointments be in 15 days does not allow enough time for a thorough vetting of candidates. Due to the six-year term and the governor's office's due diligence in seeking members who have a personal passion and general knowledge of CTE, this process naturally takes some time. Given the six-year term limit, it is imperative that these decisions be made thoughtfully to ensure that members are selected who are invested in the long-term success of the Council and CTE.

13. Should this Council be continued? To what extent and in what ways would the absence of the Council affect the public health, safety, or welfare?

Yes. The Tennessee Council on Career and Technical Education serves as a CTE advocate for both academic and skills training for students to ensure their preparedness for the workforce. The TCCTE provides visionary ideas, conducts research, identifies research, disseminates information, recognizes outstanding and best practices in CTE, and coordinates process improvement of career and technical education. The Council provides transparency around CTE funding across the state and is a critical partner in promoting several key state initiatives aimed at meeting Tennessee's workforce demands like the Tennessee Promise and the Drive to 55. Without the Council students and educators would lose a strong voice on issues related to career and technical education.

14. Has the Council developed and implemented quantitative performance measures for ensuring it is meeting its goals? If the Council has developed and implemented quantitative performance measures, please answer questions 15 through 22. If the Council has not developed quantitative performance measures, proceed to question 23.

The Council has not developed quantitative performance measures at this time.

15. What are your key performance measures for ensuring the Council is meeting its goals? Describe so that someone unfamiliar with the program can understand what you are trying to measure and why it is important to the operation of your program.
16. What aspect[s] of the program are you measuring?
17. Who collects relevant data and how is this data collected (e.g., what types information systems and/or software programs are used) and how often is the data collected? List the specific resources (e.g., report, other document, database, customer survey) of the raw data used for the performance measure.

18. How is the actual performance measure calculated? If a specific mathematical formula is used, provide it. If possible, provide the calculations and supporting documentation detailing your process for arriving at the actual performance measure.
19. Is the reported performance measure result a real number or an estimate? If an estimate, explain why it is necessary to use an estimate. If an estimate, is the performance measure result recalculated, revised, and formally reported once the data for an actual calculation is available?
20. Who reviews the performance measures and associated data/calculations? Describe any process to verify that the measure and calculations are appropriate and accurate.
21. Are there written procedures related to collecting the data or calculating and reviewing/verifying the performance measure? Provide copies of any procedures.
22. Describe any concerns about the commission's performance measures and any changes or improvements you think need to be made in the process.
23. Please list all commission programs or activities that receive federal financial assistance and, therefore are required to comply with Title VI of the Civil Rights Act of 1964. Include the amount of federal funding received by program/activity.

The Council does not receive any federal financial assistance.

If the Council does receive federal assistance, please answer questions 24 through 31. If the Council does not receive federal assistance, proceed directly to question 28.

24. Does your Council prepare a Title VI plan? If yes, please provide a copy of the most recent plan.
25. Does your Council have a Title VI coordinator? If yes, please provide the Title VI coordinator's name and phone number and a brief description of his/her duties. If not, provide the name and phone number of the person responsible for dealing with Title VI issues.
26. To which state or federal Council (if any) does your Council report concerning Title VI? Please describe the information your Council submits to the state or federal government and/or provide a copy of the most recent report submitted.
27. Describe your Council's actions to ensure that Council staff and clients/program participants understand the requirements of Title VI.
28. Describe your Council's actions to ensure it is meeting Title VI requirements. Specifically, describe any Council monitoring or tracking activities related to Title VI, and how frequently these activities occur.

The Council adheres to the Department of Education's processes for meeting Title VI requirements and training. As an advisory body, the council has implemented an annual training online or in-person for council members to inform all members of requirements. Lee Danley,

Director of the Office for Civil Rights, will be providing this training at the council's winter meeting on February 13, 2017.

29. Please describe the Council's procedures for handling Title VI complaints. Has your Council received any Title VI-related complaints during the past two years? If yes, please describe each complaint, how each complaint was investigated, and how each complaint was resolved (or, if not yet resolved, the complaint's current status).

The Council utilizes the department of education's procedures for Title VI complaints which are reported to the Director of the Office for Civil Rights for proper documentation and investigation. The Council has not received any Title VI-related complaints in the past two years.

30. Please provide a breakdown of current Council staff by title, ethnicity, and gender.

Chelsea Parker, Executive Director, Caucasian, female

31. Please list all Council contracts, detailing each contractor, the services provided, the amount of the contract, and the ethnicity of the contractor/business owner.

The Council doesn't directly manage any contracts, but is included in the Department of Education's events contract for the provision of logistical support for meetings and the production of the Biennial Report.

2016 TCCTE Sunset Hearing Appendix A: Membership

(Private Sector, Labor)
Vacant

Dean Blevins

Vice Chairman
(Postsecondary)
Director
TCAT Elizabethton
Elizabethton, TN 37643

Erik Carter

(Postsecondary, Special
Populations)
Associate Professor of Special
Education
Vanderbilt University
Nashville, TN 37203

Nicole Cobb

(Secondary, Counseling)
Executive Director of School
Counseling
Metro Nashville Public Schools
Nashville, TN 38305

Allan Daisley

(Private Sector)
Director of Entrepreneurship
and Sustainability
Memphis Bioworks Foundation
Memphis, TN 38103

Verna D. Ruffin

(Secondary)
Superintendent
Jackson-Madison County
Schools
Jackson, TN 38305

Carlos R. Hammonds

(Private Sector)
Independent CTE Consultant
Kingsport, TN 37664

Terri K. Messer

(Postsecondary)
Dean of Business and Industry
Associate Professor of
Economics
Jackson State Community
College
Jackson, TN 38301

Stephen Miller

(Private Sector)
Retired, Chairman
SouthEast Bank & Trust
Decatur, TN 37322

Andy Nash

(Private Sector)
Executive Vice President
The Farmers Bank
Portland, TN 37148

Charles Rains

(Private Sector, Labor)
Assistant Business Manager
IBEW 10th District
Dunlap, TN 37327

Arlette Robinson

(Secondary)
CTE Director
Bradley County
Cleveland, TN 37311

Tim L. Spires

(Private Sector)
President and CEO
Tennessee Association of
Manufacturers
Chattanooga, TN 37402

Chelsea Parker

Executive Director
Department of Education
Nashville, TN 37243
Chelsea.Parker@tn.gov
615-210-8412

2016 TCCTE Sunset Hearing Appendix B: Budget

The Tennessee Council for Career and Technical Education's annual budget is allocated by the Department of Education using 100% state funds. No external funding sources contribute to the Council's budget or the position of the executive director. Below is a breakdown of operational expenditures for fiscal years 2015 and 2016.

Fiscal Year 2015

Travel	\$ 7,751.97
Council Stipends	\$ 1,600.00
Council Meeting Costs	\$ 2,303.83
Training	\$ 1,265.00
Data and Phone	\$ 530.00
Professional Services by Other State Agencies	\$ 5,937.28
Below the Line	\$ 19,388.08

Fiscal Year 2016

Travel	\$ 13,381.57
Council Stipends	\$ 2,500.00
Printing	\$ 197.47
Council Meeting Costs	\$ 7,321.40
Telecom	\$ 100.03
Training	\$ 300.00
Data and Telecom	\$ 261.20
Professional Services by Other State Agencies	\$ 7,545.05
Below the Line	\$ 31,606.72

2015-16 TCCTE Recommendations for the General Assembly and TDOE

The Tennessee Council for Career and Technical Education has three priority areas that the General assembly and Department of Education should consider for the ongoing prosperity of Tennessee and its students:

Rigorous Education Opportunities: All students need academic, technical, and employability skills. Some skills are difficult to teach through classroom instruction alone. It's important to **supplement classroom learning with exposure to real-world workplaces through work-based learning (WBL)**.

Counseling for Success: Students who have a head start on postsecondary education and career exposure are more likely to successfully transition from high school to life beyond. **School counselors are central to student success and must have better awareness of regional workforce opportunities to best direct students and families.** There should be a dedicated position within the TDOE to support and align school counseling across the state to support academics, careers, and personal and social wellbeing.

Workforce Demand: **Strong public-private partnerships between industries and CTE programs are important for ensuring student success in Tennessee's growing industries.** Students need safe and quality hands-on learning opportunities and knowledge of growing careers. Industries need a talented, qualified workforce pipeline, without barriers to engaging with students in their learning.

Recommendations:

1. Business engagement in all forms of work-based learning (WBL) must expand to promote career awareness, exploration, training, and preparation. It needs to be **easier for businesses to engage** and there need to be adequate incentives to offset real costs and liability concerns:
 - a. **Clear communications, technical assistance, and language in Tennessee Code** should be aligned and updated to allow for work-based learning programs to expand
 - b. **Public-private partnerships** should be leveraged to scale WBL programs
2. **A Tennessee WBL model for Youth Apprenticeships must be developed to align with high-growth, high-demand job growth, aligned with high school and postsecondary curriculum, and promoted to Tennessee industries** with direct aid from the Department of Labor and Workforce Development, Economic and Community Development, and the Department of Education.
3. More students need **industry certifications** relevant to Tennessee employers, with help from:
 - a. **Dedicated funding** through General Assembly to cover exam fees
 - b. **Collaboration with colleges and universities** to increase access in high school
 - c. **Accurate and timely data reporting** on certification attainment
4. **Quality programs require quality equipment.** The General Assembly should allocate annual funding dedicated to updating equipment with an emphasis on secondary/postsecondary partnerships and growing TN industries. This is necessary to keep industry expanding and the tax base growing in TN.
5. **Tax incentives should be considered for businesses** that help develop quality CTE programs through:
 - a. Equipment donation,
 - b. Hosting capstone WBL experiences like internships, and
 - c. Funding professional certifications for students relevant to growing Tennessee industries.